Planning Committee

Thursday 28 April 2011

PRESENT:

Councillor Lock, in the Chair. Councillor Roberts, Vice-Chair. Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Delbridge, Fox, Mrs. Nicholson (substitute for Councillor Mrs. Foster), Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler and Wildy.

Apology for absence: Councillor Mrs. Foster.

Also in attendance: Peter Ford (Lead Planning Officer), Mark Lawrence (Lawyer) and Katey Johns (Democratic Support Officer).

The meeting started at 1 pm and finished at 5.50 pm.

Note: At a future meeting, the committee will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

107. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The following declarations of interest were made by Councillors in accordance with the code of conduct in relation to items under discussion at this meeting –

Name	Minute No. and Subject	Reason	Interest
Councillor Mrs. Bowyer	111.2 Penlee Cottage, Plymbridge Road, Plymouth 11/00018/FUL	Lives near the application site	Personal
Councillor Browne	111.2 Penlee Cottage, Plymbridge Road, Plymouth 11/00018/FUL	Ward Councillor	Personal

108. **MINUTES**

Agreed the minutes of the meeting held on 7 April 2011.

109. CHAIR'S URGENT BUSINESS

Planning Performance

The Chair reported planning performance figures for 2010/11 as follows -

- Major applications determined in 13 weeks 77.17% against national target of 60%
- Minor applications determined in 8 weeks 81.55% against national target of 65%
- Other applications determined in 8 weeks 88.35% against national target of 80%

With regard to planning enforcement performance -

- Number of outstanding cases reduced to 177 against a target of 250
- 673 cases resolved against a target of 300

(In accordance with Section 100(B)(4)(b) of the Local Government Act 1972, the Chair brought forward the above item of business because of the need to inform and consult Members).

110. QUESTIONS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC

There were no questions from members of the public.

111. PLANNING APPLICATIONS FOR CONSIDERATION

The Committee considered the following applications, development proposals by local authorities, and statutory consultations submitted under the Town and Country Planning Act, 1990, and the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act, 1990.

Addendum reports were submitted in respect of minute numbers 111.1, 111.2, 111.4, 111.5, 111.7 and 111.8.

111.1 8 ST MAURICE ROAD, PLYMOUTH 10/01802/FUL

(Mr Stephen Darke)

Decision:

Application **DEFERRED** for a site visit in order that Members could look at the effect of the proposal in relation to a previous refusal for a similar proposal at 6 St. Maurice Road.

(<u>At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations</u> against the application from Councillor Mrs. Beer, Ward Councillor).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations against the application).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from the <u>applicant</u>).

(Councillor Browne's proposal to defer for a site visit, having been seconded by Councillor Wheeler, was put to the vote and declared <u>carried</u>).

111.2 PENLEE COTTAGE, PLYMBRIDGE ROAD, PLYMOUTH 11/00018/FUL

(Taylor Wimpey (Exeter)) Decision: Application **GRANTED** conditionally, subject to –

- (a) an amendment to the addendum report to include the repositioning of plot 12 along with plots 6, 7, 10, 11 and 13, one metre north (away from the southern boundary);
- (b) a S106 Obligation, to be prioritised locally for green space, play space, primary schools and transport, delegated authority to refuse in the event that the S106 Obligation is not completed by 13 May 2011;
- (c) amendment to site operational hours in the Code of Construction to include restriction preventing work from taking place on Saturdays and no deliveries before 9 am or after 5 pm;
- (d) a 30% reduction of tariff on the Market Recovery Scheme.

Members also requested that the applicant undertook further consultation with residents over suitable boundary treatment.

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations against the application).

(Councillors Mrs. Bowyer and Browne declared personal interests in respect of the above item).

(<u>Councillor Browne's proposed amendment to the S106 Obligation</u> priority, having been seconded by Councillor Thompson, was put to the vote and declared carried).

(<u>Councillor Wildy's proposed amendment to the Code of Construction,</u> having been seconded by Councillor Wheeler, was put to the vote and <u>declared carried</u>).

(Councillor Wheeler's proposed amendment to the Market Recovery Scheme tariff, having been seconded by Councillor Wildy, was put to the vote and declared carried).

(Councillor Wildy's proposal to extend the date for completion of the S106 Obligation, having been seconded by Councillor Tuohy, was put to the vote and declared carried).

111.3 THE TOWN HOUSE, 32 HARWELL STREET, PLYMOUTH 10/02006/FUL

(Town House (Plymouth) Ltd) Decision:

Application **REFUSED** on the grounds that the proposed development, by virtue of scale, massing and design, would have an unacceptable impact on the existing community and would therefore be contrary to policies CS01, CS02 and CS34.

A further refusal ground relating to the proposal being contrary to the City Centre Action Plan to be considered by the Assistant Director of Development and Regeneration in consultation with Chair, Vice and Shadow Chair.

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations against the application).

(Councillor Wheeler's proposal to refuse the application, having been seconded by Councillor Wildy, was put to the vote and declared <u>carried</u>).

111.4 LAIRA UNITED CHURCH, 247 OLD LAIRA ROAD, PLYMOUTH 11/00028/FUL

(United Reformed Church South Western Synod) Decision:

Application **GRANTED** conditionally, subject to the amendment to condition 16 as set out in the addendum report, and a S106 Obligation, with delegated authority to refuse in the event that the S106 Obligation is not completed by 3 May 2011.

111.5 12 ELFORD CRESCENT, PLYMOUTH 11/00282/FUL

(Mr Phil Chevis) Decision: Application **GRANTED** conditionally.

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations against the application).

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard from the applicant).

111.6 PLYMSTOCK QUARRY, PLYMOUTH 11/00369/FUL

(Persimmon Homes Ltd) Decision: Application **GRANTED** conditionally.

(At the invitation of the Chair, the Committee heard representations against the application).

111.7 3-5 MARKET ROAD, PLYMOUTH 11/00238/FUL

(Barratt Homes (Exeter Division)) Decision:

Application **GRANTED** conditionally, including conditions set out within the addendum report and any additional conditions proposed by the Environment Agency, and subject to a S106 Obligation, with delegated authority to refuse in the event that the S106 Obligation is not completed by 28 May 2011.

111.8 273 TAVISTOCK ROAD, PLYMOUTH 10/01860/FUL

(Urbis Developments Ltd)

Decision:

Application **GRANTED** conditionally, subject to a S106 Obligation, with delegated authority to refuse in the event that the S106 Obligation is not completed by 18 May 2011.

112. PLANNING APPLICATION DECISIONS ISSUED

The Committee received a report from the Assistant Director of Development (Planning Services) on decisions issued for the period 28 March to 15 April 2011, including –

- Committee decisions
- Delegated decisions, subject to conditions where so indicated
- Applications withdrawn
- Applications returned as invalid

113. **EXEMPT BUSINESS**

There were no items of exempt business.

SCHEDULE OF VOTING (Pages 1 - 2)

PLEASE NOTE

A SCHEDULE OF VOTING RELATING TO THE MEETING IS ATTACHED AS A SUPPLEMENT TO THESE MINUTES.

This page is intentionally left blank

PLANNING COMMITTEE – 28 April 2011

SCHEDULE OF VOTING

Minute Applica	number and ation	Voting for	Voting against	Abstained	Absent due to interest declared	Absent
111.1	8 St Maurice Road, Plymouth 10/01802/FUL Amended Recommendation	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Delbridge, Fox, Lock, Mrs. Nicholson, Roberts and Wheeler	Councillors Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent and Wildy			
111.2	Penlee Cottage, Plymbridge Road, Plymouth 11/00018/FUL					
	Amendment regarding S106 Obligation Priorities	Unanimous				
	Amendment regarding Code of Construction	Unanimous				
	Amendment regarding Market Recovery Scheme Tariff	Unanimous				
	Amendment to extend deadline for date of completion of S106 Obligation	Unanimous				
	Officers Recommendation	Councillors Fox, Lock, Mrs. Nicholson, Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler.	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Delbridge and Roberts			
111.3	The Town House, 32 Harwell Street, Plymouth 10/02006/FUL	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Delbridge, Fox, Mrs. Nicholson, Roberts,		Councillor Lock		
	Reasons for Refusal	Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler and Wildy				
	Amended Recommendation to Refuse	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Delbridge, Fox, Mrs. Nicholson, Roberts,	Councillor Lock			

Page 2

Minute Applic	e number and ation	Voting for	Voting against	Abstained	Absent due to interest declared	Absent
		Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler and Wildy				
111.4	Laira United Church, 247 Old Laira Road, Plymouth 11/00028/FUL	Councillors Mrs. Bowyer, Browne, Delbridge, Fox, Lock, Mrs. Nicholson, Roberts, Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent, and Wheeler		Councillor Wildy		
111.5	12 Elford Crescent, Plymouth 11/00282/FUL	Councillor Delbridge, Fox, Roberts, Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler and Wildy	Councillor Mrs. Nicholson	Councillors Browne and Lock		Councillor Mrs. Bowyer
111.6	Plymstock Quarry, Plymouth 11/00369/FUL	Councillors Browne, Delbridge, Fox, Lock, Mrs. Nicholson, Roberts, Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler and Wildy				Councillor Mrs. Bowyer
111.7	3-5 Market Road, Plymouth 11/00238/FUL	Councillors Browne, Fox, Lock, Mrs. Nicholson, Roberts, Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler and Wildy				Councillors Mrs. Bowyer and Delbridge
111.8	273 Tavistock Road, Plymouth 10/01860/FUL	Councillors Browne, Fox, Lock, Mrs. Nicholson, Roberts, Thompson, Tuohy, Vincent and Wheeler				Councillors Mrs. Bowyer Delbridge and Wildy